

D. GILL SPERLEIN (SBN 172887)  
THE LAW OFFICE OF D. GILL SPERLEIN  
345 Grove Street  
San Francisco, California 94102  
Telephone: (415) 404-6615  
Facsimile: (415) 404-6616  
[gill@sperleinlaw.com](mailto:gill@sperleinlaw.com)

Attorney for Plaintiff,  
Axel Braun

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

AXEL BRAUN, ) Case No.: 12-3690 YGR (JSC)  
                  )  
Plaintiff,      )  
                 vs.     )  
                  )  
PRIMARY DISTRIBUTOR DOE      )  
NUMBER 1 and DEFENDANT DOES 2      )  
through 69,        )  
                  )  
Defendants.      )  
                  )  
                  )

**CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE  
STATEMENT  
AND [PROPOSED] ORDER**

Date: Feb. 25, 2012  
Time: 2:00 p.m.  
CtRm: 5, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

Plaintiff provides this Separate Case Management Case which deviates from the Northern District's form Joint Case Management Conference statement because of the unique nature of the case.

Plaintiff requested leave to take early discovery in order to identify the Internet subscribers whose accounts the Doe Defendants used to access the Internet and engage in the infringing activity alleged in the Complaint. See Docket No. 4. The Court granted Plaintiff's request and Plaintiff subpoenaed a number of Internet Service providers. See Docket No. 7.

1 Plaintiff resolved its claims with some potential Defendants and dismissed those  
2 Defendants with prejudice. See Docket Nos. 27 and 33.

3 In cases where the ISPs did not have information for the IP address, where the name of  
4 the subscriber did not lead to the identity of the infringer, or where after investigation the  
5 infringer is found to reside within California but outside of the Northern District, Plaintiff  
6 dismissed the representative Does without prejudice. See Docket Nos. 28 and 34. Plaintiff  
7 will re-file against some of those individuals in their home districts.  
8

9 Some of the service providers have not yet provided information. One Comcast  
10 subscriber, identifying himself as Doe Y, filed a motion to dismiss for lack of joinder.  
11 Docket No. 19. On December 18, 2012, Magistrate Judge Corley issued a Report and  
12 Recommendation denying the motion. Docket No. 32. The subscriber did not file any  
13 objections. However, the Court has not yet issued an order adopting or rejecting the  
14 Magistrate's Recommendations. In the meantime, Comcast, has refused to produce  
15 information for any of the 13 Comcast subscribers until a final ruling on the Motion to  
16 Dismiss. Although Plaintiff believes this action by Comcast is improper, Plaintiff thought  
17 the best use of judicial resources would be to wait on the final ruling rather than bring a  
18 motion to compel. Once Comcast provides subscriber information, Plaintiff will quickly  
19 investigate to determine if it will proceed against any of the Comcast subscribers.  
20

21 Currently Plaintiff intends to seek to amend the Complaint to name at least three  
22 Defendants, perhaps more depending on the information produced pursuant to the Comcast  
23 subpoena.  
24

25 Although Plaintiff believed it would be in a better position to move forward against  
26 named defendants by this point, the delay in obtaining the Comcast information has stymied  
27 Plaintiff's progress. Plaintiff believes it would be best to amend the Complaint once naming  
28 all parties it intends to proceed against rather than amend multiple times as Plaintiff makes  
each determination that it will proceed against an individual.  
29

1 Plaintiff therefore respectfully requests that the Court issue an Order adopting the  
2 Report and Recommendation of Magistrate Corley and allow Plaintiff an additional 63 days  
3 to investigate the remaining subscribers and file its motion to amend the Complaint.

4  
5  
6 Dated: 2/8/2013

/s/ D. Gill Sperlein

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
Counsel for plaintiff

**[PROPOSED] CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER**

The Case Management Conference currently scheduled for February 25, 2013 at  
2:00 p.m. is rescheduled for April 29, 2013 at 2:00 p.m.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated:

YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE